

**ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY  
FAITH-BASED INSTITUTIONAL RESPONSE HEARING**

**Under** The Inquiries Act 2013

**In the matter of** The Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

**Royal Commission:** Judge Coral Shaw (Chair)  
Dr Anaru Erueti  
Ali'imuumua Sandra Alofivae  
Paul Gibson

**Counsel:** Mr Simon Mount KC, Ms Kerryn Beaton KC, Ms Katherine Anderson, Ms Tania Sharkey, Mr Michael Thomas, Ms Kathy Basire and Ms Alisha Castle for the Royal Commission

Ms Rachael Schmidt-McCleave and Ms Julia White for the Crown

Ms Sally McKechnie and Ms Brooke Clifford for Te Rōpū Tautoko, the Catholic Bishops and Congregational Leaders

Mrs Fiona Guy-Kidd, Mr Jeremy Johnston and Ms India Shores for the Anglican Church

Ms Maria Dew KC, Ms Kiri Harkess and Mr Lourenzo Fernandez for the Methodist Church and Wesley Faith

Mr Brian Henry, Mr Chris Shannon and Ms Sykes for Gloriavale

Ms Sarah Kuper and Mr Matthew Hague for the Presbyterian Church

Ms Helen Smith and Ms Sarah Kuper for Presbyterian Support Central

Mr Sam Hider for Presbyterian Support Otago

Mr Andrew Barker and Ms Honor Lanham for Dilworth School and Dilworth Trust Board

Mr Karl van der Plas, Mr Jaiden Gosha, Ms Rachael Reed and Ms Ali van Ammers for the Dilworth Class Action Group

**Venue:** Level 2  
Abuse in Care Royal Commission of Inquiry  
414 Khyber Pass Road  
AUCKLAND

**Date:** 20 October 2022

---

**TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS**

---

**INDEX**

<b>DEREK FIRTH</b>	
Questioning by Ms Anderson	480
Questioning by Commissioners	505
<b>AARON SNODGRASS and DAN REDDIE</b>	
Questioning by Mr Barker	515
Questioning by Ms Anderson	518
Questioning by Commissioners	533
<b>DILWORTH SURVIVORS PETITION</b>	542
<b>OPENING STATEMENT BY THE ANGLICAN CHURCH</b>	544
<b>RIGHT REVEREND ROSS BAY, MOST REVEREND DONALD TAMIHERE and MOST REVEREND PHILIP RICHARDSON</b>	
Questioning by Mrs Guy Kidd	545
Questioning by Ms Anderson	556
Questioning by Commissioners	568
<b>CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE CROWN</b>	570
<b>CLOSING STATEMENT BY DILWORTH SCHOOL and DILWORTH BOARD OF TRUSTEES</b>	577
<b>CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE ANGLICAN CHURCH</b>	581
<b>CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE CATHOLIC CHURCH</b>	583

10 **CLOSING STATEMENT BY THE ANGLICAN CHURCH**

11 **MRS GUY KIDD:** Tēnā koutou katoa, the Anglican Church, our care organisations and schools of  
12 an Anglican nature very much look forward to your future recommendations.

13 In the Archbishops' statement to you, or the response to the section 20 notice, they  
14 said at para 9:

15 "Our experiences with the Royal Commission have also taught us a sharp lesson  
16 that we were too trusting of individuals. It was this trust and presumption that everyone  
17 within the Church is good at heart that contributed to the failure to address our mistakes  
18 sooner."

19 They were not alone in that failing, and much of the evidence of the last few days  
20 has dealt with paedophiles. And people who sexually abuse children are by their nature  
21 cunning, manipulative, sometimes charming. We heard the reference to the offender with  
22 the gift of the gab. They don't come with big flashing lights and warning signs. They  
23 quietly move. They will always exist in our society and they are attracted to places where  
24 there are potential victims, and I know you have dealt with cases like Marylands, places  
25 where there are particular vulnerabilities

26 So how does one assess character of people we put into these places? How do you  
27 identify a paedophile? It's almost impossible at the outset. It is not easy. Everyone always  
28 has a first time, as we know.

29 As this Royal Commission has learned, their victims are also often those who are  
30 least able to stop what is happening, they are often isolated, threatened, scared, ashamed.  
31 That is how paedophiles operate.

32 So what I wanted to address, and these were just some reflections about how we can  
33 prevent abuse, and I'd suggest it is about a number of things. Firstly, reducing or  
34 eliminating opportunities for people to offend. Really importantly, it's about increasing the

1 knowledge and the capacity of the faith community as a whole and indeed community as a  
2 whole so that we can identify and look out for suspicious behaviour when we see it, so we  
3 can protect our young and vulnerable, so that we can be open to hearing about it and  
4 believing it.

5 Not all of us have grown up or been involved in work where this is what we do and  
6 who we know. What we need to do to prevent abuse is to educate all New Zealanders  
7 about abuse and sexual abuse and its dynamics, how it works. Simple things just as the  
8 delay in reporting.

9 We also believe that what is needed is a deep understanding of Māori, Pasifika and  
10 other cultural beliefs and frameworks, how people view the world, because that affects why  
11 abuse happens, why it is not stopped, why people don't speak up.

12 So people in positions of power and governance, and all of us, need to understand  
13 that.

14 And where there is a legitimate need for and an interest in communications about  
15 abuse, and I'm talking about situations that we've heard about today between a school and a  
16 Bishop, between parents and a school, with the Police, what needs to be is that there's  
17 honest and frank communications about what has happened. Not euphemisms, not  
18 suggestions and innuendo, but flex(?) that we feel comfortable to talk about this where it is  
19 needed. So there are not barriers in the way of honest communications.

20 We need to strengthen and embolden our tamariki so they can speak up and know  
21 they will be supported. That's -- all of us need to do that as parents, as leaders in a church,  
22 leaders in our community.

23 We believe, and I know that I echo the view of one of the survivors' groups in  
24 relation to faith-based institutions, that the State must take an interest in children wherever  
25 they are. An equal interest. It is always the State's responsibility to ensure the welfare of  
26 New Zealand children.

27 One example of that is Mr Reddiex, the headmaster today supporting the suggestion  
28 that there should be the same ERO report, same extension to children who are in  
29 independent schools as there is to children in State schools.

30 Finally, and most importantly, we must place our children and our vulnerable  
31 people at the centre of all of our decision-making. They must be the centre of, when we  
32 make decisions, we think about how will it affect our children, we must keep their interests  
33 central.

1           In that regard on this topic of preventing abuse, we have learned today of the  
2 petition that you have received, and I've only had an opportunity to speak to the Primate,  
3 but they personally, the two Archbishops, support the request in the petition for a law  
4 change requiring mandatory reporting of abuse.

5           There will be an education process that needs to go with that, that's a sweeping  
6 change, but it's supported by them.

7           Now I turn to redress. Where abuse happens there must be healing. There must be  
8 restoration of the tapu and mana of the person. We believe this will only occur in a context  
9 of deep respect for survivors.

10          What needs to be sought and created in a redress process is a sense of healing and  
11 wholeness for the survivor. It is not easy.

12          Sometimes for survivors of abuse within faith-based settings, the survivor wants to  
13 reconcile to their faith, and for them that has a significant spiritual aspect, or at the very  
14 least reconnect with places and people of significance in their life.

15          We do hope that the State system will have the mātauranga needed to effect full  
16 redress to enable survivors to fulfil their potential in life. We have identified our concerns  
17 in the hope that those who are entrusted to engage and create this important new process  
18 hear and embrace what is needed, so that it is much, much more than another system  
19 without soul that survivors will engage with.

20          With that we leave you, we thank you for your work.

21 **CHAIR:** Thank you very much, Mrs Guy Kidd, and thank you, as for everybody else, for your  
22 appearances throughout the Commission's work and for the other members of your team,  
23 Mr Gray, who's not here today, but the other members who have supported you and your  
24 clients. Thank you very much indeed.

25 **MRS GUY KIDD:** Thank you.

26 **CHAIR:** Our final closing today is from the Catholic Church. Welcome back, Ms McKechnie.

27          And Sister Sue France is joining us as well.