

**ABUSE IN CARE ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY  
STATE REDRESS INQUIRY HEARING**

**Under** The Inquiries Act 2013

**In the matter** of the Royal Commission of Inquiry into Historical Abuse in State Care and in the Care of Faith-based Institutions

**Royal Commission:** Judge Coral Shaw (Chair)  
Dr Andrew Erueti  
Ms Sandra Alofivae  
Ms Julia Steenson

**Counsel:**  
Mr Simon Mount, Ms Kerryn Beaton, Ms Katherine Anderson, Ms Lorraine Macdonald, Ms Kirsten Hagan, appear for the Royal Commission

Mrs Guy-Kidd, Mr Jeremy Johnson and Ms India Shores appear for the Anglican Church

Mr Harrison Cunningham appears for the Catholic Church

Ms Helen Thompson appears for the Salvation Army

**Venue:** Level 2  
Abuse in Care Royal Commission  
of Inquiry  
414 Khyber Pass Road  
AUCKLAND

**Date:** 8 December 2020

---

**TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS**

---

**INDEX**

	<b>Page</b>
<b>Mrs M</b>	
QD by Ms Macdonald	556
QD by Commissioners	604
<b>Robert Oakly</b>	
QD by Ms Beaton	608
QD by Commissioners	637
<b>Ms C</b>	
QD by Ms Macdonald	641
QD by Commissioners	672

**MS M - AFFIRMED**  
**QUESTIONED BY MS MCDONALD**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36

**CHAIR:** Ata mārie ki a koutou katoa, nau mai, haere mai.  
Ms McDonald.

**MS MACDONALD:** Thank you, Madam Chair. Our witness  
today is Ms M. She's visible in the Courtroom today.

**CHAIR:** Yes.

**MS MACDONALD:** And she is an anonymous witness  
otherwise. Now, Ms M, this will be quite a long  
process for you, so there is a break scheduled for  
11.30 but if at any time before that you need a break,  
just indicate to myself or any of the Commissioners and  
we can take a break.

**CHAIR:** Good morning to you. Welcome to the Royal  
Commission and welcome to your two support people.  
Before we start, we're not going to bite your heads  
off, okay? Try not to be too nervous.

A. Thank you.

**CHAIR:** I appreciate it's a difficult situation. We  
are going to call you Ms M, is that okay with you?

A. Yes.

**CHAIR:** Okay, all right. I'm just going to start by  
asking you if you will take the affirmation?

A. Sure. (Witness affirmed).

**CHAIR:** Thank you.

**MS MACDONALD:**

Q. You've got a copy of your statement there?

A. Yes.

Q. And I know that you've got a little introductory  
statement that you wish to make, so please go ahead?

A. I would like to start by thanking the Commissioners  
here today for allowing me a space to share my sister  
Janie's and my experiences. I would like to  
acknowledge Sarah and Rebecca and I would like to thank

1 Lorraine for the many phone calls compiling this  
2 statement, for your compassion, your - at times -  
3 outrage on my behalf, I felt well cared for.

4 This cannot go unspoken for all who are involved in  
5 doing this Commission of Inquiry that you hear the  
6 worst of society's actions against children and young  
7 people and it must be hard at times to bear witness to  
8 these abhorrent events. I would just like to  
9 personally acknowledge this from my heart to yours.

10 On compiling this witness statement, I still get  
11 shocked by the abuse that was failed to be seen by  
12 those who could have, and should have, intervened to  
13 help protect and provide safe care for two very  
14 vulnerable and traumatised children who became  
15 teenagers, young adults and then adults who live and  
16 lived with the knowledge of the Church and State's  
17 judgements that continue to impact throughout our  
18 lives.

19 Q. Do you just want to read from paragraph 7. We'll talk  
20 a bit about your early years.

21 A. My date of birth is 1962. I have had several different  
22 names throughout my life. For the first 7 years of my  
23 life I lived in Christchurch. When I was born I had  
24 two sisters. For the first seven years of my life I  
25 lived at home.

26 Some of the timelines are approximate as piecing  
27 together some of the details is difficult.

28 My family life was very fragmented by the time I was  
29 born. My eldest sister was removed by the police and  
30 taken to live with my maternal grandfather at the age  
31 of 18 months due to neglect. She lived the rest of her  
32 life with them. My family had thus already become  
33 known to the Christchurch Child Welfare Division since  
34 before I was born and definitely by 1958. My welfare  
35 file states that on 19 February 1964 my mother and

1 father separated. At this time I was in the care of my  
2 mother and had just turned 2. My mother and father's  
3 divorce was decreed in 1965. My mother then married my  
4 stepfather two months later. They had a son born in  
5 1965.

6 I have been able to see my file with the Child  
7 Welfare Division at the Department of Education and on  
8 17 September 1966 my stepfather spoke to an officer and  
9 reported that our Mum had left us alone in the house  
10 with only Janie to care for the two younger children.

11 Q. Do you have a memory of that yourself, Ms M?

12 A. At that time? Yeah. I remember sitting in the gutter  
13 crying because there was no food, having someone come  
14 and take us to school because we weren't going to  
15 school. Yeah, we did all sorts of things. We used to  
16 steal food and stuff just to get by.

17 Q. And I'm just going to take you to a note on - sorry,  
18 I'm trying to find the witness reference, but it's  
19 actually written in your statement, so I'll just read  
20 it.

21 There was a note on your Child Welfare file which  
22 described Janie and Ms M are both attending primary  
23 school, their class teachers report that "the little  
24 girls are often inadequately clad on cold mornings and  
25 from their apparel it has been speculated that they  
26 dress themselves unsupervised in the mornings."

27 If you want to just go to paragraph 22 and read from  
28 there?

29 A. I fell in the fire while playing with Janie on the  
30 sofa. I remember sitting in the fire and being taken  
31 to the hospital. I had skin grafts and still to this  
32 day bear the grafts on my left-hand and inside thigh  
33 where the graft was taken from.

34 I remember coming out of hospital, falling off a  
35 swing and breaking my arm.

1 I remember going door to door trying to sell fish  
2 we'd caught out of the sewerage ponds near where we  
3 live.

4 I remember Mum being really sick and me at 4 trying  
5 to do the ironing, but the ironing board was too high  
6 and I dropped the iron on my eye. It wasn't Mum who  
7 helped me, it was a neighbour I went to for help.

8 I remember spending heaps of time playing on the  
9 beach and stealing food from old drunks because we were  
10 starving.

11 I remember sitting in the gutter crying from hunger.

12 My stepfather sexually abused both Janie and me.  
13 One night as an adult I had a dream about it and  
14 remembered it. I went to Janie and asked her if she  
15 remembered anything and she said yes, he had abused her  
16 too. It did happen. In my and Janie's Child Welfare  
17 Division file notes a complaint about it was mentioned,  
18 so it was known to others too. A note in earlier files  
19 I saw says the house we lived in with Mum and our  
20 stepfather was so bad it would be condemned.

21 There is much more I could tell you about this time,  
22 but I want to move on. The next memory I have is of my  
23 mother being in bed rambling about things that didn't  
24 make sense even to a 7 year old. Janie rung an  
25 ambulance and Mum was taken away. This led to Janie,  
26 my brother and myself being placed at Huntsbury House.

27 Q. What was it like for you at Huntsbury House?

28 A. For me personally, it was great. I had clothes, I had  
29 food, I went to school, yeah, I was with Janie who was  
30 my main reason. So, for me it was actually a reprieve  
31 really.

32 Q. And then if you go to paragraph 31?

33 A. Mum died in hospital in 1969. She was 29 years old.

34 She would have been 18 when she had Janie.

1           My stepfather committed suicide a few months later  
2           in 1969. I remember someone coming up to Huntsbury  
3           House to tell us he had died. I believe at the time  
4           that he was my real father but he wasn't.

5 Q. And I'll just get you to clarify that Huntsbury House  
6           was in Christchurch, but it was owned and run by the  
7           North Canterbury Hospital Board?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So, we'll move on now to how you became under the care  
10          of the Anglican Social Services?

11 A. Will I read that?

12 Q. Yes, read that from paragraph 33 and then I'm going to  
13          bring up a couple of exhibits.

14 A. Okay.

15 Q. And I'll quote from them.

16 A. My younger brother went to live with his father's  
17          sister and we lost contact with him. I think he had a  
18          difficult life, but he has never talked to us in much  
19          detail about it.

20           We must have come into the care of the Anglican  
21          Social Services when my mother died because on my  
22          records there is a letter from Reverend M J Goodall  
23          from Anglican Social Services.

24 Q. If I could call up or you could call up Exhibit 6, 006,  
25          and if you could just bring up the first paragraph,  
26          zoom into that, please.

27          "Further to our telephone conversation, I am writing to  
28          give details of (redacted names) commonly known as  
29          (redacted). In February they were placed in the  
30          Huntsbury Home with their stepbrother. The mother died  
31          very soon after they had entered the home and I had  
32          some discussion concerning the placement of the three  
33          children. On the 28th of May the stepfather was found  
34          dead and then following investigations we located the  
35          father of these children."

1 If you could bring up the next paragraph?

2 "After discussion with Mr and Mrs", this is your  
3 grandparents, "After discussions with the children's  
4 grandparents" and with yourself, and this is talking to  
5 the Social Services, Child Welfare, "We have sent the  
6 children to stay with Mr and Mrs [redacted] on the  
7 West Coast. These folk are known to the Child Welfare  
8 Department and were willing to take the children for a  
9 time to see how things develop. In view of the  
10 distance from our Agency, we would feel that  
11 supervision of these children by Child Welfare  
12 department would be much more helpful and in view of  
13 the apparent inability of" and that is a reference to  
14 your natural father "to take responsibility for the  
15 children, we wonder if it would be wiser for the  
16 children to become State wards. We would be grateful  
17 for your comments on this situation".

18 There's a handwritten note on this letter. "DCWD",  
19 I think we can assume is the Department of Child  
20 Welfare Office, the note says, "This is similar to the  
21 query raised over the admission of the Social Services  
22 boy to Marylands and them suggesting we takeover. I  
23 would appreciate your talking over this policy matter"

24 And if you could bring up exhibit 007, there is a  
25 reply to that letter.

26 A. Sorry?

27 Q. There is a reply to that letter from Anglican Social  
28 Services and we are just going to bring that up and I  
29 am going to read from that as well. If you could just  
30 bring up the first paragraph there, a bit more than  
31 that, please? The first chunk. That's lovely, thank  
32 you.

33 So, this is a reply to Reverend Goodall at the  
34 Anglican Social Services and it comes from Mr Lyons of  
35 the Child Welfare Division. "These children are not



1 unknown to us. Acquired guardianship by the  
2 Superintendent of Child Welfare is regarded as a very  
3 serious step. The children would need to be in very  
4 unfortunate circumstances and either the parents  
5 admitting a complaint or this division being able to  
6 prove one."

7 And if you could go to the next paragraph?

8 "Whilst children such as these are in your care and  
9 favoured with your support it would legally be quite  
10 difficult to sustain a complaint. On the other hand of  
11 course the parent may not be willing to agree to a  
12 complaint being laid.

13 In a way you can see this difficulty exists with  
14 many children in the care of private agencies like  
15 yourself".

16 The last paragraph:

17 "If you need any assistance in someone visiting  
18 these children from time to time I am sure my colleague  
19 would be happy to assist. You would really only need  
20 to write to him offering him suitable information and  
21 making this request".

22 If you can go to paragraph 40, Ms M and read from  
23 there?

24 A. It was odd that they needed to make a complaint against  
25 our parents because the reason we were in Anglican care  
26 was that we didn't have any, or at least any that we  
27 could live with.

28 This 26 June letter was then sent on to the Child  
29 Welfare Division, our new foster parents, with a typed  
30 addition. Do you want me to read that?

31 Q. Yes, you can read that out.

32 A. "If Anglican Social Services proceed with my suggested  
33 course of asking you to keep an eye on these children I  
34 will send you over the small file that we have. The  
35 letter from Anglican Social Services suggests that

1 these people may be known to you. I am not inclined to  
2 suggest that a complaint be laid because this would  
3 establish a principle that would allow for many such  
4 cases to be committed to our care. I personally  
5 believe that this practice should be reserved for cases  
6 of special difficulty."

7 Q. Just carry on from there.

8 A. We are orphans for all practical purposes, so I don't  
9 understand why Child Welfare Division didn't think we  
10 were its concern. I think our first foster parents got  
11 money for looking after us, but I don't know where the  
12 money came from. In a letter from our first foster  
13 father years later he notes that we were asked by the  
14 Church of England Social Services to take us for a  
15 holiday. Janie and I were told we would go and stay  
16 with this foster family for a six week holiday. We  
17 remained there for five years, 1969-1974. No-one came  
18 to check on us once we were placed with the foster  
19 parents on the West Coast. No-one from Anglican Social  
20 Services checked on us. No-one from Child Welfare  
21 Division checked on us.

22 Our first foster father raped, abused, assaulted and  
23 terrorised us for the next 5 years. He is dead now, he  
24 died in 2003. He was 50 when we went to live with him  
25 and 84 when he died.

26 Q. Can you just go to paragraph 46 now?

27 A. The first foster family had a farm on the West Coast.  
28 Here I became known by their surname. Here are just  
29 some snapshots of what our life was like at the farm.

30 Have you ever heard a crayfish scream as it's put  
31 into boiling water? I was terrified and then later  
32 when I went to bed there was a live crayfish in it.  
33 The foster father had put it there just to see me react  
34 in fear.

1           On Christmas morning I opened my present and found  
2 my own pet lamb's tail in it. That was my foster  
3 father.

4           I learnt to laugh and show no fear. I realised that  
5 he wanted us to cry, so I learnt not to. I still don't  
6 cry very often, however distressed I might be.

7           Imagine being a little girl and trying to judge your  
8 carer's mood by how much milk he put in his whiskey and  
9 then knowing what was coming. Watching your sister  
10 Janie being thrown across the room and then going to  
11 sit on your foster father's knee trying to keep him  
12 sweet so you wouldn't be next.

13           We often went to school with black eyes. Janie even  
14 more than me. We both went to school covered in  
15 bruises from the stock whip and no-one ever asked us if  
16 we were okay.

17           Imagine having to watch the man who was supposed to  
18 be looking after us threaten his wife with a loaded  
19 shotgun, tearing her clothes off in front of you and us  
20 not knowing if the gun was going to go off.

21           Janie shared a story with me as an adult, that she  
22 once got hold of the gun and pointed it at our foster  
23 father, who then taunted her to shoot him saying how  
24 gutless she was because she didn't.

25           Homemade pies used to be decorated with his false  
26 teeth. I have so many issues with food, hang ups from  
27 this time.

28           I remember not having many friends. Kids used to  
29 tease me because I couldn't speak properly. I think my  
30 speech was affected by the trauma I was suffering.

31           On one occasion, one of my girlfriends was allowed  
32 to come and stay at our place. Janie and our foster  
33 mother had gone home to Christchurch to visit her  
34 parents. Janie and I were never allowed to go away  
35 together. One of us always had to stay with our foster

1 father. The room where his wife slept had twin beds.  
2 Our foster father said to ask my friend if she wanted  
3 to jump into bed with us and she said no.

4 I was sent to the bedroom and told to come into him  
5 when she was asleep. I fell asleep and woke up in the  
6 early hours of the morning. I was petrified because  
7 I'd fallen asleep and I went into bed with him. Can  
8 you imagine being a child lying in bed pretending to  
9 sleep, holding her breath stiff as a board and hoping  
10 against hope he would leave her alone?

11 Janie was my everything. Our foster father could  
12 see this so he would play us off against each other.  
13 Janie and I used to fight with each other so we  
14 wouldn't have to go over and scratch his back, which  
15 was always a prelude to sexual abuse, including rape.

16 I didn't find out 'till years later when we were  
17 adults that our foster father used to drug Janie and  
18 lend her out to some of his mates. She was between 10  
19 and 15 when we lived there.

20 I could tell you time and time again of things that  
21 took place that would make your hair curl. After  
22 5 years of this abuse of every kind I became a walking  
23 zombie.

24 His wife was also around 50. This was her second  
25 marriage. She would sleep in the front room of the  
26 house because he snored and she couldn't sleep. I  
27 think it is impossible that she did not know about the  
28 sexual abuse. Her husband was very violent to her, so  
29 she was no protection for us. She did not defend us in  
30 Court but chose to stay with him.

31 We were isolated in so many ways. Physically, there  
32 was only one other house in the district. We didn't  
33 feel there was anyone we could tell about what was  
34 happening every day. Our foster father told us we were  
35 responsible for our stepfather's suicide. He used to

1 say all the time, "Your mother's dead. You've killed  
2 your stepfather and your grandparents don't want you,  
3 so where are you going to go?"

4 For many years, I had a recurring nightmare of  
5 escaping up this rise not far from where we lived and  
6 then hearing his voice saying this phrase and giving  
7 up.

8 You never knew when things were going to happen. I  
9 walked as if on egg shells holding my breath. I learnt  
10 to lie as I was going to be in trouble whether I'd done  
11 something or not. If I got away with it, good. And if  
12 not, I was going to be punished anyway. I stole money  
13 for food. I remember many times sitting on the bus  
14 travelling home from school and looking out the window  
15 into people's homes, especially in winter, seeing  
16 families sitting around a fire and wishing I was in  
17 there. They looked so happy.

18 I now want to share with you a poem Janie wrote  
19 about that time.

20 "I'm lying still in the darkness of the night. I  
21 know all the sounds, the squeaks of the doors opening  
22 and shutting, all of the groans the floor boards have,  
23 all having their own voice. The sounds of the house as  
24 it cools down. I am lying awake for what may happen.  
25 Praying to God, if there is such a thing, help us  
26 tonight. Yes, my little sister is awake too. I know  
27 this. I feel this in the depths of the night. She's  
28 so still, so quiet, I can hardly hear her breathing. I  
29 sense her tension. I wish I could get her and hold her  
30 so tight that she would dissolve and be safe forever.  
31 The lounge door opens. Slowly, ever so slowly, it  
32 squeaks like a wild animal crying out for its last  
33 breath. He's standing in the doorway. I can feel him.  
34 The fear in this room is so thick you could choke on  
35 it. I lie as still as I can, so still, as still as

1 death. I can smell him closer, smell his breath, smell  
2 his sweat, I can feel his breath on me. Fear engulfs  
3 me".

4 Q. Thank you. Now in the 5 years that you were there,  
5 no-one from the Anglican Church Social Services ever  
6 checked on you?

7 A. No-one.

8 Q. Can you talk now about the first attempt that you and  
9 your sister made to get some redress for the situation?

10 A. On the 3rd of May 1974, after being at the first foster  
11 parents for five years, I went to school and Janie  
12 decided to go to the Police with the support of a  
13 girlfriend whose partner was a Police Officer. I did  
14 not know this was what she had in mind.

15 Janie had a locked deposit tin where she kept her  
16 diary and money and personal things. Our foster father  
17 broke into it and read in her diary that she was going  
18 to the Police that day. I now know that some of the  
19 pages described the abuse he was doing to us. He tore  
20 the pages out and started ranting and raving saying he  
21 was going to kill her. He grabbed his shotgun and took  
22 off. His wife was in town. Janie was to go to where  
23 she worked at the time. I was left in the house alone.  
24 I was terrified that he was going to kill Janie, the  
25 only person who I loved, and that I would be left at  
26 the farm alone. I was 12 years old. It got dark and I  
27 remember going to sleep. The next thing I remember was  
28 the phone ringing. I wasn't meant to answer the phone,  
29 but I did. It was the Police. They asked me if I was  
30 in the house alone and I said yes, and I was really  
31 scared as the foster father had a loaded shotgun and  
32 he'd said he was going to kill Janie. That night I was  
33 taken to a doctor and asked all sorts of questions and  
34 he did an intimate examination. Janie had one too. I  
35 wasn't sure why, no-one explained anything. I was then

1 taken to the Police Station and saw Janie. I was so  
2 relieved. We gave statements and we sat in a room with  
3 beds. I now know it was a cell and I went to sleep.  
4 Later that night, we were placed in a State Child  
5 Welfare Division family home in town. We stayed there  
6 until after the trial. It was okay. We felt safe  
7 there for the first time in five years.

8 Our case was heard in the Supreme Court on 31 July  
9 1974. We had to give evidence at a deposition four  
10 weeks earlier. The foster father was charged with  
11 unlawful sexual activity.

12 Q. Now if we just go to the trial. Can you tell the  
13 Commissioners some of the evidence that was heard in  
14 the trial and that you know this because you've seen  
15 the transcript?

16 A. Okay. So, when my foster father was arrested, he did  
17 have a loaded shotgun in the car and he told the Police  
18 that he'd run over a possum on the way home and he  
19 hated to see anything suffer and he wanted to go back  
20 and shoot it.

21 He denied any knowledge of having read Janie's diary  
22 and ripping pages out but after he was arrested, he was  
23 searched and got the papers out of his back pocket and  
24 the diary and said, "This is what you're looking for".

25 Q. Can you go to paragraph 74?

26 A. In his statement to the Police, the foster father  
27 admitted we slept in the double bed with him most  
28 nights. He said his wife slept in the front bedroom in  
29 a single bed. He said the girls slept there with him  
30 so we could scratch his back. He said this happened  
31 most nights. He said his wife was aware of the  
32 arrangement.

33 His wife admitted that her husband had been in the  
34 double bed with me a couple of nights before Janie went  
35 to the Police. She admitted we used to have to go into

1 bed with him to give him back rubs and that sometimes  
2 we would stay the whole night. I remember that she  
3 didn't have to give him back rubs.

4 When his wife gave evidence in Court she eventually  
5 became quite hysterical, denying that he had done  
6 anything wrong and screaming about us.

7 The doctor that examined us, Dr Henry Salisbury,  
8 gave evidence that by the age of 12, in his opinion, it  
9 was clear I had had penetrative sexual activity on  
10 multiple occasions, but I had not yet started my  
11 periods.

12 The abuse I suffered from my foster father was so  
13 traumatic, so complete – emotional, physical, sexual –  
14 that I had become almost incapable of thinking. It was  
15 as if I lived in total shock. I hardly remember giving  
16 evidence, but I know from the transcript that I gave  
17 evidence that my foster father regularly had  
18 intercourse with me. I said that the day Janie  
19 disappeared I heard him break into the cash box where  
20 Janie kept her diary and I heard the sound of pages  
21 being ripped out. I saw him get his rifle and say he  
22 was going to kill Janie.

23 Q. If you can go to, have a drink of water if you want.

24 A. I'm all right.

25 Q. If you can go to paragraph 83.

26 A. The foster father then pulled Janie's diary from his  
27 back pocket and said, "This is what you are looking  
28 for". The Police Officer gave evidence that it was  
29 obvious that there had been pages torn out of it. The  
30 foster father then handed over the torn pages which  
31 contained very matter of fact statements from Janie  
32 about having to go in with him. He said they were all  
33 lies.

34 The officer testified that in a search of the house  
35 he found a tube of sexual lubricant in the top drawer



1 of the room with the double bed that his wife testified  
2 she never slept in.

3 Even though I was just 12 and the medical evidence  
4 was that we had been repeatedly vaginally penetrated,  
5 and the foster father had torn out incriminating pages  
6 of Janie's diary which showed I had been telling the  
7 truth about what I saw and heard him do, he was  
8 acquitted by a jury in the Supreme Court of sexually  
9 abusing us.

10 I never understood what the jury were thinking. Did  
11 they just not want to face the truth? Or did they  
12 think we didn't matter? But then I found out that the  
13 jury were directed by the trial judge Justice Casey to  
14 find him not guilty on the charge relating to me, so I  
15 guess they didn't get the chance to make up their own  
16 mind.

17 Q. Can I just call up Exhibit ANG ending 6893? If you  
18 could zoom in on the first - this is a newspaper  
19 clipping from that time. I will just read, I am just  
20 going to read the third paragraph down on the left-hand  
21 side. "Mr Justice Casey intimated to the all-male jury  
22 that he would direct acquittal on the charge involving  
23 the younger girl after defence counsel Mr Hampton made  
24 submissions for acquittal. 'The girl's evidence was  
25 not capable of corroboration', His Honour said."

26 If you can carry on reading from paragraph 87?

27 A. I have been told that sexual offences had to have  
28 corroborating evidence back then but my own evidence  
29 was corroborated by the doctor, by Janie, by admissions  
30 from the foster father that he had us sleep with him  
31 and by the Police evidence about the diary. I do not  
32 know what corroboration the Judge was waiting  
33 for - that he would just admit it?

34 The jury were all men. But I would love to know  
35 what they were thinking of my foster father when they

1 heard and saw him and whether at least some of them  
2 thought we were telling the truth. I think some of  
3 them would have believed us. I will never know. Janie  
4 managed to get the transcript, but I am hoping to  
5 locate the entire Court file to see if it sheds any  
6 light on the Judge's reasoning.

7 Q. Carry on.

8 A. The Police and a social worker had laid their complaint  
9 under section 13 of the Child Welfare Act 1925. They  
10 did this soon after Janie went to the Police. The  
11 complaint was that we were indigent in poverty and  
12 living in a bad environment. After my foster father  
13 was acquitted, the Police asked for leave to withdraw  
14 their complaint.

15 I don't understand how the Police thought there was  
16 enough evidence to lay a complaint and then because a  
17 jury was directed to find him not guilty of rape, the  
18 Police didn't go through with their complaint. I now  
19 know it was in a different Court with a different and  
20 lower standard of proof but that makes it harder to  
21 understand.

22 There is a note from the Assistant Director of  
23 Social Work, AF Campbell, from before the trial that  
24 noted, "Should the foster father be found not guilty  
25 the Police complaint will be difficult to prove.  
26 Regardless of the outcome, he will not have the  
27 children back".

28 Social Services must have discussed the possibility  
29 or asked him to take us back. After everything we had  
30 alleged against him, not just the rapes, this seems  
31 incredible.

32 One of the things that upset me was that in their  
33 note the Assistant Director of Social Work wrote:

34 "When the girls made their allegations to the  
35 Police, it was necessary for the Police to remove a

1 loaded rifle from the foster father's possession  
2 following threats by him to kill the girls. I feel  
3 this was possibly an impulsive act and doubt if he  
4 would have carried out his threat, however the girls  
5 were badly shaken by this experience".

6 Clearly this man accepted that the threat had been  
7 made so why did he minimise it? Why did he side with  
8 the adult man against the children? Is threatening to  
9 kill a child not bad enough? The same report noted  
10 that Janie had gone to the Police several times because  
11 our foster father was following or stalking her.

12 Q. Can I just ask you how the trial verdicts affected your  
13 life after that? If you just read from paragraph 94.

14 A. 94?

15 Q. 94, yes.

16 A. Everyone thought we were liars after the trial. I now  
17 know that an acquittal means the jury are not sure  
18 beyond reasonable doubt that a person is guilty. But  
19 people don't understand the Court process, so by  
20 directing the jury to acquit my foster father, it was  
21 as if the judge had labelled us liars. Whether or not  
22 that was the intention, it followed us everywhere.  
23 Everyone was warned about us.

24 In a note the social worker Mr Gay wrote for the  
25 file he said he was concerned at how vindictive our  
26 foster parents were about us and to the extent he  
27 refused to say where we were going to be placed in open  
28 Court to keep it from them. But then he says he thinks  
29 we should be separated from each other and "I also  
30 agree with the foster parents that any foster parents  
31 that ...".

32 Q. That the girls?

33 A. "... go to should stay with should be made well aware of  
34 the allegations that these girls have made, not only  
35 against our first foster father but against other men

1 on previous occasions" but we'd never made a Police  
2 complaint against anybody else. It was only our foster  
3 father's defence lawyers who tried to smear us in  
4 Court.

5 There was an order made on the 12th of August 1974  
6 committing me to the care of the Director-General of  
7 Social Services. On the 8th of August, Janie was to be  
8 under the supervision of a social worker for 12 months  
9 as she was over 16.

10 It was decided that both Janie and I couldn't stay  
11 on the West Coast because of the threats to kill us.  
12 The Police did nothing about the threats. On several  
13 occasions he was seen waiting or following us, stalking  
14 us. The rest of our family (our father, sister and  
15 grandparents) were in Christchurch, so the Department  
16 decided we should be in Christchurch.

17 They got in touch with Anglican Social Services who  
18 said they had nothing available and on 11 June 1974 DS  
19 Gay wrote that he had got in touch with Mr M Goodall  
20 from Anglican Social Services who said they had no  
21 information on us. Our foster father had also been in  
22 touch with Anglican Social Services.

23 Q. Just to recap, what you've just explained is that Child  
24 Welfare made you wards of the State after the trial?

25 A. Yes.

26 Q. And that they got in touch with the Mr Goodall who had  
27 sent you to the West Coast who said he didn't have any  
28 information on you?

29 A. (Nods).

30 Q. So, if you can go to paragraph 100 and tell the  
31 Commissioners about your second foster family?

32 A. We were put on a train and brought over to  
33 Christchurch. I was met at the Christchurch Railway  
34 Station by my second foster parents. They lived on a  
35 farm in a small village not in Christchurch itself. I

1 had never met them before. Social Services separated  
2 Janie and me and no-one spoke to us about what we  
3 wanted. No-one told us where we were going.

4 My first day there I can remember standing on the  
5 homestead porch. I was stunned. I think I was in  
6 shock after everything had happened to me. Janie had  
7 disappeared. I didn't know these people and to this  
8 day I can hardly bear to remember myself standing  
9 there, wondering where I was, wondering where Janie  
10 was, wondering if I'd ever see her again.

11 I lived with the second foster family until the 30th  
12 of June 1977 when I was placed in a welfare family  
13 home. I absconded from the foster home three times  
14 over a three-week period and my files had many notes of  
15 the trouble I got into and the reasons they thought I  
16 did it. No-one ever really asked me why.

17 At this time, I had a social worker whose name was  
18 Joan Cunningham. She would occasionally come to do a  
19 house visit but not very often. One such visit  
20 resulted in her reporting "I found her to be a very  
21 pleasant, well-mannered girl. The foster mother  
22 describes her as being very helpful and dependable in  
23 the home".

24 I couldn't tell her of all the stuff that was  
25 happening to me at the time, especially after the Court  
26 case because by then we had reputations as being  
27 trouble because people assumed we'd lied and the second  
28 foster family were warned about us. During my time  
29 there I was regularly sexually abused by the foster  
30 father. This came to the attention of the authorities,  
31 the social worker made comments and notes to the  
32 Director of Social Work in town, PW Howells in June  
33 1976. Some of the noting is redacted but some children  
34 had made a complaint that they didn't want to go back  
35 to that foster family for the holidays. The notes say

1 that other children had complained about seeing the  
2 foster father doing things to me on the sofa.

3 Q. I'll read the next portion which is from the social  
4 work report. "Mrs X rang me most concerned. She had  
5 had (the child's name) home for the previous day and  
6 they had been telling her of her holiday. She said  
7 that they had stated that they definitely don't want to  
8 go back to that foster family again because they claim  
9 that when Mrs (foster parent) was out working in the  
10 shop on Saturday afternoon, Mr (foster parent) and Ms M  
11 were doing things on the sofa in the kitchen which  
12 wasn't nice, indicating that they were conducting  
13 themselves improperly. Whether they were cuddling or  
14 having some sort of sexual play, I do not know. The  
15 lady would give me no further information, but she said  
16 she didn't want her daughters going to that sort of  
17 house. I recommend that the Director look into this  
18 situation as he sees fit, as firstly Ms M came into  
19 care because of her and her sister's accusations  
20 against the previous foster father of indecently  
21 assaulting them".

22 A. What does this even mean? I was 14 years old. Why is  
23 the recommendation not to remove me from the foster  
24 family's care? Does this mean that even an independent  
25 witness wasn't enough to protect me or that I was being  
26 blamed? Was I not worth protecting because I was  
27 already damaged goods? There is a handwritten note on  
28 the letter which says that the foster parents were the  
29 social worker's friends.

30 Q. Can you just call up Exhibit 20, please, and if you  
31 could just highlight, pull up the highlighted bits,  
32 thank you. There's two subjects, holiday home and  
33 children's allegations against foster father.

34 Just to confirm, when it says, "children's  
35 allegations", those aren't your allegations, are they?

1 A. No.

2 Q. They're somebody else's. "Mr and Mrs X (foster  
3 parents) and Ms M were interviewed separately and then  
4 together in relation to the allegations made against  
5 the foster father. Ms M denied any allegations against  
6 the foster father. She usually blushes when confronted  
7 with misdemeanours but remained cool and calm".

8 Thank you. Carry on from 108.

9 A. I can't really remember being asked about it but I know  
10 that after my last experience with disclosing abuse and  
11 the trauma of the trial and the acquittal and being  
12 labelled as liars, I would have been terrified to say  
13 anything else in front of the abuser. Was this  
14 reported abuse of me equated with a misdemeanour of  
15 mine?

16 Q. Can you go to paragraph 110.

17 A. Nothing was done. Even after independent witnesses,  
18 with no reason to make anything up, said they had seen  
19 him abusing me sexually, no-one did anything to protect  
20 me. It seems as if having made a complaint once, which  
21 was the truth, I am forever seen as being at fault.  
22 Two months after the complaint in August 1976 after I  
23 had run away for the first time, my foster mother told  
24 the social worker that she was giving up her Saturday  
25 job.

26 The first time I ran away it was not long after the  
27 abuse which was reported and ignored.

28 Q. Can I just get you to go to paragraph 115?

29 A. By this time, I had developed quite a reputation. I  
30 didn't trust anyone and got into trouble stealing and  
31 doing silly things. Sometimes I had but often I  
32 hadn't. The foster mother used to accuse me of  
33 stealing silly things like a sock just because one went  
34 missing from the laundry. I don't know how well she  
35 was really, looking back. I remember coming across her

1 shaking her fists and screaming at the sky. I was  
2 scared.

3 After talking to Mrs Cunningham, I wrote to the  
4 second foster parents. I didn't say anything about the  
5 abuse, but I tried to be as polite and kind. I wrote,  
6 "I am writing to say how sorry I am for running away  
7 and causing you a lot of trouble. I gather you don't  
8 know how I feel I don't want to be hurtful, but I feel  
9 it would be better if I didn't return. I enjoyed  
10 hearing from you, but it only made my decision harder".

11 The foster mother wrote back to Mrs Cunningham and  
12 described this as a "hostile letter" and said, "We have  
13 done our best by her and she has caused a lot of  
14 trouble in our home through lies and pinching and now  
15 we don't care what happens she can go on her way".

16 Q. And then you went, you got away from the second foster  
17 parents, and that was really your own decision to do  
18 that?

19 A. (Nods head).

20 Q. And you went into a Social Welfare home for a time?

21 A. Yep.

22 Q. What was that like for you?

23 A. I think probably, I think probably the people running  
24 the place couldn't cope with a whole lot of kids.  
25 There was both boys and girls and we used to sneak out  
26 on a Friday night and go down to the bay. And if the  
27 girls got in before the boys, they'd let the boys in  
28 and vice versa. So, I think we probably were the last  
29 straw for them really because I left not long after  
30 that.

31 Q. If you go to paragraph 120.

32 A. At the same time, there were reports from the house  
33 parents of how good I was with children. It said I was  
34 extremely good with their children who absolutely  
35 adored her. They say she is marvellous with young



1 children and she would have in fact like a job looking  
2 after children.

3 Q. Now we go on to your third foster family. Are you  
4 okay? Do you need a break? Okay. If you go to  
5 paragraph 121. We won't say the denomination of the  
6 Church.

7 A. I was placed with a Reverend and his wife. They lived  
8 in a very small village. I had met them when living  
9 with my second foster family as I used to attend the  
10 youth group run by the Reverend.

11 Q. I will just confirm at this point that the Minister was  
12 not in the Anglican Church?

13 A. No.

14 Q. Thank you.

15 A. After the school holidays they came up for a transfer  
16 to a larger town. I wanted to stay with them and they  
17 said if it was okay with welfare I could, as long as I  
18 went to school. I then shifted to the new place with  
19 them.

20 I can tell you that when I lived with them in the  
21 first place I started popping pills. One day I freaked  
22 myself out by the amount I had taken. I was very  
23 unhappy. I wrote a letter saying what I'd done and  
24 then I went to bed. They found the note and made me  
25 get up and debated whether I needed to go to the  
26 hospital and decided against it. They made me promise  
27 I wouldn't do it again. I didn't keep that promise.

28 We all shifted to the new place and the Reverend and  
29 his wife were very busy in their new parish doing  
30 weddings and funerals. I had to babysit all the time  
31 and I resented it. I decided on a Saturday afternoon,  
32 after having been told I had to babysit again, that I'd  
33 pop some pills out of the medicine cabinet and I mixed  
34 it with alcohol. I remember cooking tea for the kids  
35 and feeling like I wanted to lay down, so I lay down on

1 a beanbag. The kids couldn't wake me up and went to  
2 the neighbours who got hold of the Reverend and his  
3 wife and I was rushed to the hospital. I had my  
4 stomach pumped. It was said by a doctor I would have  
5 died within the hour if not admitted to the hospital.  
6 The family were furious with me and told me I had  
7 abused their trust and I didn't understand why they  
8 were so upset. I became part of the family and it was  
9 agreed they would adopt me. I would have been about 16  
10 at the time and then I became known by their surname.

11 The adoption came about because at the time I really  
12 wanted to be part of the family. I wanted to belong  
13 somewhere. I believed being adopted would give me some  
14 rights and they wouldn't be able to send me back  
15 because I'd really belong to the family.

16 Q. The adoption process took a very long time, is that  
17 correct?

18 A. About two years I think.

19 Q. If you just tell the Commissioner a bit more about the  
20 Minister?

21 A. The first time the rapes happened with my foster  
22 father, his wife was out of town. I was 16 or so. At  
23 the time I didn't her to go because I knew the abuse  
24 would happen. I had had so much abuse that my  
25 instincts told me that he was building up to something.  
26 I remember he used to play fight with me and it always  
27 ended up with him on top of me, so I knew I couldn't  
28 move. The very first night she was away it started.  
29 First with fondling and then intercourse. I did not  
30 know how to stop him. I did not want it to happen. I  
31 thought once it was over it would be over.

32 The next day when I was cooking tea he said, "I'm  
33 going out for a minute". I asked him where he was  
34 going, and he replied, "to buy condoms". I was so  
35 stunned, and I realised the abuse was going to continue

1 and I didn't know what to do. Even when his wife  
2 returned, the abuse continued.

3 My adoption was eventually completed in 1981 when I  
4 was 19 years of age. So, at the time he started having  
5 sex with me I was his foster daughter and then I was  
6 his legal daughter.

7 One day we'd gone into a fish and chip shop and all  
8 of a sudden I felt sick. I had to go outside. The  
9 Reverend came out and asked me what was wrong. I said,  
10 "I'm pregnant". He said, "You can't be". I said, "I  
11 am". He told me to go to the doctor's and ask for the  
12 morning after pill and to tell the doctor it was my  
13 boyfriend's. I did have a boyfriend at the time, but  
14 we'd never slept together. I went and did as I was  
15 told. I remember bleeding.

16 Around about the time I overdosed and ended up in  
17 hospital, I started seeing a psychiatrist. I saw her  
18 for a very long time and I'm sure I told her that I  
19 thought I was pregnant to the Reverend, but she has  
20 denied that I did. She worked for Child, Youth and  
21 Family. I talked to her about what it was like to be  
22 part of the family and she talked to them about why I  
23 was being so difficult and not fitting in. I was about  
24 16 at this time. I was very unhappy and very  
25 distressed.

26 Q. Did you tell anybody at any point about the abuse that  
27 was happening? Just go to paragraph 132.

28 A. I started working for the Council and a girlfriend at  
29 work asked me what was wrong, and I told her  
30 everything. She then went to a supervisor and told  
31 him, and he contacted my foster father who was furious  
32 with me but somehow it was covered up.

33 The Reverend's wife started going to a Pentecostal  
34 Church and she took me along with her. I liked it and  
35 decided that if I was to be accepted there, I would

1 have to tell the Minister about what had happened. I  
2 went to the house where they were holding Bible study  
3 and I said I wanted to talk to the Minister. He was  
4 busy but I told a lay preacher and later that night  
5 talked to the Minister. I think the Minister and lay  
6 preacher believed me.

7 The Minister arranged to make me out to the  
8 Reverend's to confront him. When confronted, my foster  
9 father didn't deny he had had sex with me but said it  
10 had only happened the once and he had sought counsel  
11 within the Church and prayed to be forgiven. I don't  
12 think the Minister or lay preacher did anything  
13 further.

14 The adoption was already finalised before I told my  
15 foster mother about her husband abusing me. I can  
16 remember not wanting the adoption to go through but not  
17 knowing how to stop it. There is much more I could say  
18 about this time, but it is still painful to recall. I  
19 so wanted to be part of the family and I thought this  
20 would be it at last. I had been abused by every man  
21 who was supposed to have loved me, so I thought I am  
22 the common denominator, so it must be my fault.

23 I think his wife believed me, but she didn't do  
24 anything. A few years later she decided she wanted a  
25 divorce and so came to me to ask me to help her by  
26 saying what he had done. I was so upset that she  
27 didn't believe me enough to ask me to help her - I was  
28 so upset that she believed me enough to ask me to help  
29 her but that she didn't do anything for me about his  
30 actions. I had a lawyer at the time and he said I  
31 didn't have to help her, so I didn't.

32 Q. And some time later you went to the Police about what  
33 had happened?

34 A. On 24 May 1990, I went to the Police and laid a  
35 complaint against the Reverend. I was 28 years old. I

1 went to the Police about him because in his role as a  
2 Minister of the Church he would have kids from places  
3 like Samoa come to stay. I went out there one day and  
4 they had this young teenage girl there and she hardly  
5 spoke any English. And it just freaked me out. I  
6 thought, "What if she ...". I only saw her the once and  
7 I thought, "I cannot not say something". I was  
8 wondering, "Is he fostering children or having them to  
9 stay through his role as a Minister?"

10 When investigated, he admitted to Police that sexual  
11 intercourse had taken place, but no charges were laid.  
12 He said in his statement to the Police that I had  
13 seduced him and that I was just a boarder at the time,  
14 yet no-one questioned the fact that they had adopted  
15 me. I was legally his daughter.

16 Q. If you could call up NZP23006. If you can go to  
17 page 2, please. This is the interview that was  
18 conducted by the Police Officer when the Minister was  
19 living by that time in 1991. If you can pull up just  
20 the first Q and A, if you could. That's lovely, thank  
21 you. So, I'm just going to read a fair amount of this  
22 out. Obviously, the Q is the question and the A is the  
23 answer from the person being interviewed.

24 "Q. How did you first meet Ms M?

25 A. She attended the Sunday night youth group at  
26 the Church. She was then a foster child in the home."

27 Then there's quite a long discussion about how you  
28 came to be in their home. And if you can just pull up  
29 the paragraph after that? Halfway down the page:

30 "Q. Were you aware that Ms M had been involved in a  
31 complaint against a previous foster father?

32 A. I was aware, but I wasn't aware of the details  
33 and I definitely wasn't aware of any abuse in the  
34 second foster family home.

1 Q. At the time that you moved to where you were  
2 living, what was Ms M's status in your family?

3 A. She was a foster child still under the control  
4 of Social Welfare, but she was discharged around March  
5 1979 as she was then deemed to be independent as she  
6 had left school and had a job at the Borough Council"

7 If you could pull up the last paragraph of that page  
8 and the first paragraph of the following page.

9 "Q. After Social Welfare discharged her, what was  
10 your understanding of her position in your family home?

11 A. She was now a boarder and was in fact paying  
12 board on a weekly basis".

13 If it you could go down to the paragraph, scroll  
14 down a bit for me, thank you. Go down a little bit  
15 further and the next bit as well. That will be fine,  
16 that will be fine, we'll start with that.

17 "Q. What can you tell me about the sexual  
18 relationship between you and Ms M?" I won't read all  
19 of this.

20 "A. It began on a Friday night after my wife had  
21 left. Ms M came into the room and sat on the floor  
22 beside my feet then moved to sit between my legs. At  
23 around 10.00 I indicated that I was going to bed and  
24 she went off to her bed. I went in to say good night  
25 and she was in her nightie. I sat on the side of the  
26 bed and she sat up and put her arms around me. The  
27 caressing started again and it took off from there.  
28 After a while it became apparent that it would be  
29 unwise to continue in that room where my other daughter  
30 was sleeping and we moved into the sun room next door.

31 Q. Did you think that this was her first time at  
32 having intercourse?

33 A. No, she seemed certainly much more experienced  
34 than I was.

1 Q. Were you aware if she had been sexually active  
2 with other boys?

3 A. Yes, my wife and I had been concerned about her  
4 sexual activities and had actually asked her to go to a  
5 doctor to have a check against STD." And the last  
6 question on the page:

7 "Q. She was happy to have sex with you that night,  
8 no force was used [sic]". There's no question mark  
9 there.

10 "A. No, she was very willing and I would say that she  
11 instigated it".

12 If you just pull out, just go on to the next page.  
13 If you could go down the page? If you can go to the  
14 last question and answer.

15 "Q. Is there anything else you wish to say about  
16 this whole matter?

17 A. Yes. The problems between my wife and myself  
18 were not able to be resolved and we separated mutually  
19 agreed on 24 October 1989. Just prior to that my wife  
20 went down and traced Ms M and met with her. The  
21 purpose of this was to inform her of the impending  
22 separation and to try to re-establish contact with her.  
23 On her return, she told me that the trip was wasted and  
24 that Ms M had seemed to be further off the track than  
25 ever and was still living in a lesbian relationship  
26 with her friend. I am now engaged to be married and  
27 have bought a house and wish to be left to enjoy  
28 living. I deeply regret and always have what happened  
29 12 years ago between Ms M and myself".

30 So, if you could pull up page 1 of that document,  
31 which is the letter, and if you could go down to the  
32 third paragraph. If you go to the third paragraph down  
33 and pull that out, please.

34 So, this is a letter written by the Detective  
35 Sergeant in charge of your case, Ms M, and it is a

1 letter written on 29 May 1991 to your foster father.  
2 "The circumstances of the intercourse are generally not  
3 in dispute either by you or by Ms M. You have agreed  
4 that intercourse did take place. It is quite apparent  
5 that you have taken advantage of a rather insecure  
6 young woman, for your own personal gratification. That  
7 is something which will be with you for the rest of  
8 your life and I am of the firm view that you have  
9 breached her trust in you at the time."

10 And if you could pull out and go to the last main  
11 big paragraph.

12 "Having reviewed the nature of the allegations, I  
13 have taken into account the age of the complainant at  
14 the time, her consent to the intercourse and the fact  
15 that a formal adoption had not occurred until after  
16 these events. I find that there is no evidence to  
17 bring criminal charges against you and therefore no  
18 further action will be taken. The Police investigation  
19 will be filed".

20 Ms M, did you say to the Police that it was all  
21 consented to?

22 A. No.

23 Q. If you can go to paragraph 140 and tell the  
24 Commissioners what the Police—

25 A. 140?

26 Q. 140, yes, please, and say what it was the Police said  
27 to you?

28 A. The Police said they didn't think I would win a case  
29 against him due to my age when he started abusing me  
30 and the fact that I had already been through the case  
31 with my first foster father, so it would be used  
32 against me.

33 I know that there is an offence for having sex with  
34 someone who is under your care and protection. I know  
35 that was the offence he was investigated for. I know



1 that consent is not a defence. Maybe he was  
2 untouchable because he was a Minister of the Church.  
3 But surely a Minister doing what he did to me is even  
4 worse than someone else doing it?

5 When I was with the third foster family, I had a  
6 male social worker. I read on my file years after I'd  
7 left their care that the first time he met me he wrote  
8 quite a favourable report about me but the Reverend and  
9 his wife are recorded as saying that I was really good  
10 at manipulating people and he shouldn't believe what I  
11 say.

12 Q. I'm going to ask you now about the impact that all of  
13 this has had on you. And after we've done that  
14 section, it will probably be time for a break.

15 A. I have had many challenges caused by the years of abuse  
16 I suffered. For most of my adult life, I have chosen  
17 to see myself as crazy, because to see otherwise would  
18 mean that the whole world was crazy, and I wouldn't be  
19 able to function if this was true.

20 I've tried to escape living because I didn't feel  
21 entitled to even breathe. I have nightmares most  
22 nights. I have flashbacks and these were increased by  
23 the 2019 shootings that occurred in Christchurch.

24 I have major depression, Chronic Complex Post  
25 Traumatic Stress Disorder. I was diagnosed with  
26 dissociative disorder. I have struggled with  
27 addictions all my life. I worked so hard to conquer  
28 one addiction and then need something else to cope with  
29 my life with the abuse.

30 It has affected my education due to the sustained  
31 long-term effects. I have never been able to work  
32 full-time. I haven't married or been in a relationship  
33 for more than 30 years. I would have liked to have  
34 been married and had children.

1           The name of the man who adopted me still triggers  
2 me. He instils great fear in me, even now. When I was  
3 talking about taking part in this Commission of  
4 Inquiry, I was signing a consent form and I couldn't  
5 say his name - I literally couldn't make myself say it.  
6 My friend who was with me had to say it. I think the  
7 effect on me is still so great because I felt and feel  
8 such a deep sadness because when I went to those people  
9 I thought I might actually get a family at last. It  
10 makes me so sad to think of me at that stage, wanting a  
11 family so badly that I wanted to be adopted by those  
12 people.

13           Even after all my years of counselling, there are  
14 things that won't go away. The first foster father on  
15 the farm dabbled in hypnosis. The first time he tried  
16 to hypnotise me I wasn't under, but I pretended to be,  
17 to be still. He stabbed me with safety pins and then  
18 asked me what I'd do if he got me pregnant. I didn't  
19 know what pregnant was but by the way he said it I knew  
20 it was bad. He would try to use his hypnosis on me and  
21 Janie. I learnt to pretend to be hypnotised while he  
22 stabbed me with pins and scissors to see if I was  
23 probably under, not to show any pain. To this day I  
24 cannot practice any kind of breathing exercise because  
25 it triggers me with memories of him.

26           When we had to bathe, my first foster father used to  
27 tell me how to wash. He had a particular word for  
28 genitals. And even today, every time I bathe I  
29 remember him. A simple every day act that should be  
30 pleasant or just practical is ruined because I remember  
31 him and what he used to say. It still haunts me as an  
32 adult of 58. I know my bathroom is safe. I bought  
33 some lovely things for my bathroom. I say to myself,  
34 "We're not going to do this, this is your place, this  
35 is safe, here it goes again".

1       It's a marker of what that does to you. It is  
2       challenging to live day-to-day because of things that  
3       nobody could know, things that nobody could see. It  
4       has had a major effect on my wairua and my connection  
5       to my heart and soul has felt deeply blemished,  
6       believing I was going to hell if I didn't get things  
7       right and that I was being punished here on earth by  
8       God because of abuses committed in the name of God by  
9       an ordained Minister and the Anglican Church that sent  
10      us to the coast to our first foster family and then  
11      washed its hands of us.

12      I continue to attend weekly therapy so that I can  
13      get support and make my life more manageable.

14      My sister Janie died at the age of 51 from cancer.  
15      She was fun loving, an avid supporter in her work with  
16      people experiencing bipolar disorder. Janie was also  
17      diagnosed with bipolar disorder. She was a stone  
18      carver, a photographer and a rebel. She loved  
19      passionately and along with her illness had bouts of  
20      depression. This manifest itself by suicide attempts  
21      and admission to Sunnyside Hospital. The love of  
22      Janie's life was Kath. Janie and Kath were together  
23      for 28 years. They had a commitment ceremony when it  
24      became legal to do so.

25      The loss of my sister when she died at the age of 51  
26      did and still does deeply impact on my life. I  
27      strongly believe if she hadn't experienced that  
28      horrific abuse from the West Coast she would still be  
29      here fighting to have her voice acknowledged. When the  
30      first foster father died, she went to find his grave  
31      and she peed on it. She laughed when she told me this,  
32      but I know she was so traumatised by our time with him  
33      just as I was.

1           The funny thing is that I am regularly the person  
2 that people turn to in crisis, yet so often I don't  
3 feel I count.

4           I work in the area of child protection.

5           I am a producer of a radio programme about mental  
6 health and I have done this for approximately 14 years.

7           I live alone because I feel unable to cohabit.

8           Me and my sister were let down by the system over  
9 and over again beginning with being dumped by the  
10 Anglican Social Services with the first foster parents  
11 and just left there. We've had to carry deeply etched  
12 scars all the time, trying to live with a sense of how  
13 insensible our lives were, how we were never believed  
14 and in fact punished because we told the truth.

15           If people had truly wanted to help us, it wouldn't  
16 have taken a lot to see we were being horrifically  
17 abused repeatedly, but people were blinkered. We were  
18 not bad children. We were abused, neglected and left  
19 unprotected by the State and the Anglican Social  
20 Services.

21 Q. Thank you. I just wonder if it would be a good time to  
22 take a break?

23 **CHAIR:** I think it's probably a very good time for  
24 everybody. I think we all need a break. Okay, we'll  
25 take about 15 minutes and you can have a cup of tea and  
26 recover.

27

28           **Hearing adjourned from 11.26 a.m. until 11.45 a.m.**

29

30 **MS MACDONALD:**

31 Q. Ms M, we're going to talk about your attempts to get  
32 redress. We have already talked about the Court and  
33 the Police and we're now going to talk about your other  
34 attempts to get redress.

1           So, if you can go to paragraph 168 of your statement  
2           and just read from there, thank you.

3 A. I read in a woman's magazine that you could claim  
4           compensation for abuse suffered in State care. Janie  
5           and I agreed to do it. We wouldn't have done it if we  
6           had known how much of a nightmare it would be.

7           We got a lawyer who everybody recommended and it got  
8           to the point of having hearings but our lawyer kept on  
9           putting it off, and one day we rang and spoke to his  
10          Secretary and she said, "This is more than my job's  
11          worth to tell you this but he's not going to take the  
12          case and I suggest you go and see this other lawyer".  
13          We ended up hiring Andrew Cadenhead.

14 Q. Okay. I'm going to ask you about what Mr Cadenhead was  
15          able to do for you later but now we'll go on to talk  
16          about ACC.

17 A. 171?

18 Q. Yes, please.

19 A. My sister and I applied for ACC in the late 1980s and  
20          were awarded some compensation for the abuse and its  
21          effects. Janie got a payment from ACC and I got  
22          several smaller payments, but this Statute of  
23          Limitations thing caused us a lot of hassle because we  
24          brought a claim over 20 years after the abuse.

25          I find ACC difficult to deal with. For example, in  
26          2003 I got a letter declining my application for an  
27          independence allowance. This was because I had had  
28          four small lump sum payments; three for sensitive  
29          claims and one for a back strain.

30          So, for one claim I received \$5,950 from a maximum  
31          pay-out of \$7,000.

32 Q. I will just interrupt you there, sorry, Ms M, but if  
33          you could pull up document 31, please, because there's  
34          a letter that shows it quite well.

35 A. Okay.

1 Q. It might be easier. Here we are, if you could pull out  
2 the highlighted bit?

3 So, what this shows, and you can correct me if I'm  
4 wrong, what this shows is that you were paid a  
5 percentage of the maximum that's allowable for a  
6 specific type of claim?

7 A. (Witness nods).

8 Q. But each one is a separate claim?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And what they say is your combined lump sum entitlement  
11 is over 100 per cent, so they decline your application  
12 for an independence allowance?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. But what they've actually done is they're adding up  
15 percentages from different claims?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Thank you. So, if you could move on to paragraph 175  
18 and talk about the lawyer that you found, Andrew  
19 Cadenhead.

20 A. At the time of the ACC payment, my lawyer Andrew  
21 Cadenhead was my executor and he mentioned that because  
22 I was adopted the Reverend would be able to apply for  
23 any money if I had died. Even though I did not imagine  
24 I would have much when I died, I was offended and  
25 deeply shocked and told Andrew that if I died and he  
26 gave that man any money I would come back and haunt  
27 him. I asked how I could become legally unadopted and  
28 he said it would be hard to do but that he would try.

29 I managed to get Legal Aid to assist me to do this.  
30 My lawyer had to get consent from the Solicitor-General  
31 to even make the application and this was granted on  
32 the ground that the Adoption Order was made by mistake  
33 as to a material fact or in consequence of a material  
34 misrepresentation.

1 Mr Cadenhead was prepared to argue that the Reverend  
2 had misled the Family Court about being a fit and  
3 proper person when he adopted me but in the end my  
4 application was not contested by him. He did not  
5 appear and was not represented.

6 On the 31st of March 1994, I became officially  
7 unadopted. I had changed my name by deed poll in May  
8 1991. I chose to use my mother's and grandmother's  
9 hyphenated name for my surname, and I changed my first  
10 name too.

11 At the age of 50 I presented my story on the 21st of  
12 May 2012 to the Confidential Listening Service Panel.

13 After I used the Confidential Listening Service, I  
14 received a letter on the 21st of July 2014  
15 acknowledging the length of time that had passed and  
16 that due to an overload they hadn't began to process my  
17 application.

18 Q. Can I just interrupt you again there? The Confidential  
19 Listening Service, was that a number of people you told  
20 your story to or was it just one?

21 A. I think there were two.

22 Q. And that was a judge, was it?

23 A. Not sure.

24 Q. I believe it was a judge who you had contact with?

25 A. Yes, it was, sorry, yes.

26 Q. Sorry about that. So, if you just carry on from, if  
27 you go to paragraph 180.

28 A. Yep.

29 Q. And four lines down is the sentence which starts, "I  
30 was then offered"?

31 A. I was then offered to be part of the Fast Track  
32 Process. I received an offer of compensation. This  
33 offer became tainted by the process and the stress that  
34 occurred.

1           When I was offered this money, I was given a  
2 pamphlet entitled, "Frequently asked questions". It  
3 said something like, "With a view to helping you make a  
4 decision we really want you to accept the Fast Track  
5 Process". I felt like this pamphlet contained a veiled  
6 threat in its wording under the section "how much will  
7 I get if you do a full assessment of my claim under the  
8 normal process" it stated, "Until the assessment has  
9 been completed, we cannot tell you how much you might  
10 be offered, if there is a payment offered. It might  
11 result in an offer of the same amount or it may be more  
12 or it may be less, or there is a possibility that you  
13 will receive no payment at all".

14           I think this wording is enough to make people take  
15 what's offered because there's a clear message that you  
16 mightn't receive any offer whatsoever.

17           It was also implied that if we didn't take the  
18 offer, the process to have your claim assessed would  
19 take a long time. At this point, I had already been  
20 part of this process for nearly three years and still  
21 the Ministry had not even started the process of  
22 looking at my claim.

23           **CHAIR:** Can I just interrupt? I am sorry to interrupt  
24 but just to be really clear, I take it this was the  
25 MSD, Ministry of Social Development claim for abuse you  
26 suffered while you were in Social Welfare care; is that  
27 right?

28 A. Yes.

29           **MS MACDONALD:** That's correct.

30           **CHAIR:** That was just to clarify.

31           **MS MACDONALD:** Yes, thank you.

32 A. In regard to the delay, the pamphlet stated, "We are  
33 very sorry that there's been such a delay. A large  
34 number of people have come to us with claims because  
35 our assessment process is so detailed it has meant we



1 have not been able to keep up with the number of claims  
2 coming in and this is why we developed the fast track  
3 option for eligible claimants to consider, so we can  
4 resolve your claim faster and help to provide closure."

5 I and many of the claimants were not in a position  
6 to afford legal assistance and frankly, my experience  
7 to date with the legal system did not inspire me to ask  
8 for advice.

9 I accepted the offer on 4 June 2015. I had been on  
10 the Invalid's Benefit for most of my adult life. I  
11 work part-time to maintain my mental stability. One of  
12 the questions concerning the offer was what would  
13 happen to my benefit if I accepted the offer? And the  
14 pamphlet stated, "These settlement payments are not  
15 considered income or cash assets for the purpose of  
16 assessing your entitlement to a benefit for 12 months  
17 after the date of the payment. Any cash assets you  
18 have or income that you may make from the payment after  
19 12 months might affect your benefit. To confirm what  
20 your entitlement is you need to discuss it with your  
21 Work and Income case manager".

22 My advocate and I tried to get answers about whether  
23 I would be penalised for having this money after the  
24 year's grace period. I didn't want to spend it all at  
25 once. I wanted to be careful with it.

26 We approached many people seeking answers. The  
27 considered view was it should not affect my  
28 entitlements, but I was told that after one year if I  
29 had assets over \$8,000 then I would be impinged on my  
30 entitlements.

31 My advocate and I tried to find solutions. For  
32 example, depositing it into KiwiSaver and exploring  
33 possible ways of using this money to enhance my future.

34 Every time we thought we found a solution, they told  
35 us I couldn't do it. My advocate and I were very

1 proactive in seeking advice and attended an appointment  
2 at WINZ on 2 September 2016. Again, we asked about the  
3 payment. The caseworker left to speak to another  
4 advisor and came back into the office and informed me  
5 that I'd lost my entitlements to the accommodation  
6 supplement from 5 September 2016, which equated to a  
7 \$65 per week reduction. I started crying. I hardly  
8 ever cry. I couldn't afford to live, as I had  
9 significant debts. They told me I needed to live off  
10 the money until I'd gone below the income levels. I  
11 got an email on the 7th of September 2016 which quoted  
12 policy and legislation but didn't say exactly where the  
13 quotes came from. That made it harder for me and my  
14 advocate to look into.

15 I was on the Invalid's Benefit, now called Living  
16 Support. The pamphlet had said that the payment would  
17 have no effect on the benefit for the first year. This  
18 encourages people to blow the lot in one go. But then  
19 a further humiliation is that receipts have to be  
20 provided because you are not allowed to be reckless.  
21 They literally said I could not blow it on a \$15,000  
22 diamond ring, for example.

23 "If the money is spent frivolously for  
24 non-essential items, for example a \$15,000 ring, can  
25 apply section 74(d) of the Social Securities Act."  
26 That is a section which says a benefit can be  
27 terminated if a person has directly or indirectly  
28 deprived himself of any income or property which  
29 results in qualifying for that or any other benefit or  
30 an increased rate of benefit.

31 How dare they tell me that. What if a diamond ring  
32 was the only thing I'd ever wanted in my life? If I  
33 had had other money, say from an inheritance or I was  
34 able to work full-time, then nobody could interfere  
35 with how I spent the compensation money. But when you

1 are poor because of the effects of abuse, they don't  
2 let you have the payment for something you are entitled  
3 to. If someone like me or Janie did want to buy one  
4 nice thing, they were telling me I wasn't allowed to.  
5 I already have benefit deducted for my part-time  
6 earnings. It's like they want to keep you poor.

7 It took me to 30 December 2016 to arrive at under  
8 \$8,000.

9 The settlement money became tainted. I felt like I  
10 was being raped over and over again by the very system  
11 that claimed good faith to redress an historical abuse.

12 Someone said something to me about the money being  
13 for my future. I realised then that I didn't believe  
14 in a future. Janie was my life and soul. I believed  
15 if she died there would be no purpose for me to live.  
16 She was my reason for living - the money was not for  
17 the future as I didn't believe there was one. She's  
18 been gone for 10 years and I can't get used to her not  
19 being here. I wouldn't see her for a time and even  
20 when she disappeared for a while just dealing with her  
21 own situation, I would know when she was coming back  
22 and she would come.

23 This settlement money was for events that happened  
24 to me in the past and its ongoing cost to my wellbeing.  
25 I was desperate and told my story to a reporter. I  
26 went under an alias at the time.

27 I don't want any other survivors to have to be  
28 traumatised by the welfare State process, although I  
29 would hazard a guess that a large portion of recipients  
30 are probably beneficiaries due to the mental health  
31 effects from the State-based or faith-based abuse or  
32 neglect in the first place.

33 Q. Thank you. Can I just ask you to go to paragraph 200?

34 A. I looked at a website about a class action website for  
35 victims. Some were only paid \$2,000 or \$4,000. That

1 was less than my payment. My file was in with the  
2 Confidential Listening Service for three years and not  
3 looked at, so the amount I got was a guess I suppose.  
4 No-one had looked at what I went through. I suppose  
5 that means it wasn't really properly funded.

6 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Can I, again just for a point of  
7 clarification, the files, is that with MSD rather than  
8 the Confidential Listening Service in paragraph 200?

9 **MS MACDONALD:** No, the file initiated with the  
10 Confidential Listening Service and they passed it on to  
11 MSD.

12 Q. I think that's the way it happened?

13 **CHAIR:** It was a pathway into compensation.

14 **MS MACDONALD:**

15 Q. Is that right, Ms M?

16 A. I'm not sure, sorry.

17 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** That seems to be, I don't think  
18 the Listening Service would have sat on it for three  
19 years. It sounds like the amount of time it would have  
20 been with MSD, I am assuming.

21 **MS MACDONALD:** Yes, that's probably right but we can  
22 definitely follow that up and correct that.

23 Q. So, the Confidential Listening Service helped you with  
24 something else, didn't it?

25 A. After I used the Confidential Listening Service to talk  
26 about the abuse perpetrated on me, Judge Caroline  
27 Henwood helped me get the information from when I tried  
28 to lay charges against my adopted father who was a  
29 Minister.

30 Judge Henwood got the Detective to tell me why they  
31 didn't proceed. The Detective said the Police never  
32 disbelieved me but because of my age at the time and my  
33 other allegations, they had taken the decision that we  
34 wouldn't win. The Detective said they would make a  
35 different decision now and would prosecute.

1 I still don't understand this because the Reverend  
2 had admitted it and there was no defence of consent. A  
3 lawyer told me that the law in force at the time  
4 included people under 20.

5 Q. And did you try to get any redress, to make any contact  
6 with the Anglican Church?

7 A. I made some contact with the Anglicans in 2010. It  
8 would have been after the 4th of September 2010 because  
9 that was when the Confidential Listening Service gave  
10 me contact with the Church and I remember I rung them.  
11 The person said that because of the earthquake, there  
12 are archivists just starting to sort through records  
13 and will pass on the information and contact me when  
14 sorted. I did not hear back but didn't follow-up any  
15 further. That was 10 years ago. I would really like  
16 to follow this up.

17 Q. And have you ever followed up with the other Church  
18 that the Minister belonged to?

19 A. I have never followed up with the other Church about  
20 the Minister who adopted me. I think he has retired  
21 now. I know he was promoted to a higher office in his  
22 Church.

23 I have thought about going back to the Police since  
24 he was never charged and he admitted what he did. I  
25 was so worried when I saw that teenage girl in his  
26 house. But I think I never followed up again because I  
27 am still scared of him. We tried to make a proper  
28 complaint about our first foster father and just ended  
29 up being laboured as liars.

30 I think I am so scared of the Reverend because I  
31 didn't necessarily expect much from other men who were  
32 supposed to be looking after me because every man had  
33 abused me, but he was a Minister. I thought I could  
34 trust him. And yet, he behaved just like all the  
35 others.

1 Q. Can I just ask you, if you were to get any form of  
2 resolution either from the Church of the Reverend  
3 because just to clarify, the Reverend was a State  
4 foster parent? You weren't placed with him through the  
5 Church he was a Minister of?

6 A. No.

7 Q. But if you were to get a resolution from either the  
8 Anglican Church who put you on the West Coast or this  
9 other Church, how would you feel if the same thing  
10 happened again and WINZ deducted benefits that you have  
11 to live on?

12 A. I certainly would like to see a change, that no other  
13 person coming forward, and if there was redress for  
14 myself, that I would not be penalised.

15 Q. If you can go to paragraph 209.

16 A. If the State gives financial compensation for the  
17 trauma and the wasted potential that left people  
18 dependent on benefits, I would like it to be theirs to  
19 do with however they choose. It is the final insult to  
20 say, "We let you down and we are going to give you some  
21 money to compensate for the fact you now exist on  
22 benefits. But now we're going to take money off you at  
23 the same time because you exist on benefits". It is  
24 like all those years of blaming myself and being blamed  
25 for things is repeating again.

26 I do not exist on benefits because I don't want to  
27 work full-time, but because I can't work full-time. I  
28 would have loved to have had a normal childhood, even  
29 if it was in care, and to have had a career in  
30 childcare or teaching. I might have been a lawyer and  
31 working on this Commission, that's a bit of a thing  
32 with Lorraine.

33 I do my absolute best to contribute to society in  
34 lots of different ways. If I was not on a benefit,  
35 then any compensation would be properly mine. If I had

1 wanted to go and buy a ring or go around the world, I  
2 could have but it's like the State wants to constantly  
3 remind me that I am not important and they are in  
4 charge of me.

5 No compensation can magically make me whole again  
6 and able to do a full-time job in child protection,  
7 which is what I do part-time and what I love. Nothing  
8 can put me back to how I might have been.

9 But any compensation should be for me. To  
10 compensate me and let me do something that makes me  
11 happy. Or let me do something that makes me feel a  
12 little secure.

13 I think if the State is the cause of suffering and  
14 trauma, then financial compensation should be given  
15 without any strings.

16 I would like to be re-compensated for the money  
17 wrongfully taken from me and the compensated for the  
18 trauma of that process. I work really hard in my  
19 recovery and as an example, my counsellor who has  
20 supported me for some time now is stopping doing ACC  
21 counselling as the reporting takes too much time. I'm  
22 going to have to stop seeing her as I cannot afford to  
23 pay her out of my benefit.

24 I have significant debt with WINZ. Every year I  
25 submit my earnings and every year they tell me I owe  
26 them money. No matter what my budget and mental health  
27 peer support worker tried to figure out, through no  
28 fault of my own, it again looks like I will be  
29 penalised this year. So, I have no faith in a system  
30 that has always caused me great distress and continues  
31 to re-victimise me over and over again.

32 I think there were a lot of alarm bells that were  
33 ignored. We should not have been left with the first  
34 foster parents. The Anglicans should have checked up  
35 on us. I should have been removed from the second

1 foster family. The Reverend should have been  
2 prosecuted. But every time another thing happens and  
3 the authorities take the side of your abuser, you just  
4 think it's your fault.

5 I want to see change as I believe a lot of crap is  
6 still going on.

7 I do not think that a complainant in a trial should  
8 be labelled a liar just because the accused is  
9 acquitted. I believe by "warning" all my foster  
10 parents, those men were given a green light to abuse me  
11 because they knew no-one would believe me.

12 Having had the Court case about the first foster  
13 father set the course of Janie and I being separated,  
14 branded as liars, instead of a system supporting us it  
15 chose to vilify who we were and even in my case  
16 continue to tell future foster parents to be wary  
17 because I had made past allegations against men.

18 Q. Can I just ask you, you and Janie were separated. How  
19 long were you separated for?

20 A. When we came from the coast? Well, she went on to meet  
21 a family, she went on to meet another foster family who  
22 adopted her and told her that we weren't sisters and we  
23 weren't to have anything to do with each other.

24 Q. And she managed-

25 A. I think probably - Janie was adopted really quick as  
26 well. She was maybe 17 and it was only like, we'd come  
27 over from the coast after the Court case and Janie was  
28 still under supervision and then she met this family  
29 that eventually adopted her. But before even that had  
30 happened, she had attempted suicide and, yeah, I can't  
31 believe that this family was allowed to adopt her.

32 Q. That family made a point of keeping the two of you  
33 apart?

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. If you can go to paragraph 224.



1 A. I have had to pay dearly. I have spent my life in  
2 counselling, not able to work full-time due to my own  
3 mental health, having a fear that God, the universe,  
4 the divine, whatever you want to call it, might have  
5 negative effects on me in the future.

6 I am not vindictive and am not doing this out of  
7 hate. I am doing this so I can give Janie recognition  
8 that was never given to her while she was alive.

9 I am doing this because I realised that I never  
10 thanked her for trying as an eight year old little  
11 girl, being abandoned by all adults in our home for a  
12 couple of days, with me four years and my brother one  
13 and a bit, left to take care of us.

14 I am doing this because Janie had the courage to go  
15 to the Police on the coast and this in turn rescued me  
16 from becoming a walking shell as I was so close to  
17 being.

18 We were always judged and held to account for abuses  
19 that weren't our fault. Our reputation preceded us,  
20 only this reputation was false. Wherever we went, we  
21 tried to be heard.

22 Janie would be here today doing this if the effects  
23 of years of trauma hadn't taken her life at the age of  
24 51. She would have stood alongside me to tell her  
25 story.

26 So, this is my very heartfelt thanks to her and a  
27 reclaiming of the frightened child who has found the  
28 courage and support to say to the Minister who adopted  
29 and abused me, "You lied about me, you shattered a very  
30 thin veil of trust. I stand here today, and I put the  
31 blame right back in your hands. How you take this and  
32 make peace with it is your business but know that I  
33 will no longer carry your shame".

34 Q. Thank you. Ms M, is that everything you want to say?

35 A. Yes.

1 Q. If the Commissioners want to ask you questions, any  
2 questions, will that be okay?

3 A. (Nods).

4

5

6

7

\*\*\*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34

**MS M**

**QUESTIONED BY THE COMMISSIONERS**

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Kia ora, I have brief questions. Thank you for your evidence today. I did wonder whether Janie, I know she went to the Police on the West Coast and that was very brave of her but whether later she approached MSD for redress or the Church?

A. We both tried to originally go to MSD and start the process of looking into getting redress through the Church, no sorry through the Social Welfare, and we couldn't get Legal Aid, we couldn't get Legal Aid to pursue it. And then she got sick and yeah.

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** I keep thinking through your evidence too about with redress, about how you often have to do this on your own or you might be guided by a lawyer, and whether there's a need for some sort of advocacy service to help survivors like yourself?

A. I think that would be really great. I think survivors, run by survivors would be really great, certainly something I'd be interested in if it ever happened.

**COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Particularly in your case, we've seen this with many other survivors too who have been in both faith-based as well State-based homes, family homes and foster care, just knowing where to go to get redress, there's the Police, MSD, the Churches, some guidance would be helpful?

A. I think it would be and it's incredibly - it takes so much energy to fight a system that say that they want to show good faith and then you have to put yourself in their hands and think that they truly do want to show good faith, to find that that doesn't happen.

1 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** Yep. I see also in your evidence  
2 that Judge Henwood and the Confidential Listening  
3 Service, I mean that was part of what they did and I  
4 see a lot happened after you met with them?

5 A. Yes.

6 **COMMISSIONER ERUETI:** That you were offered these  
7 different channels, MSD and others, to seek redress but  
8 we don't have that process anymore. Thank you so much  
9 for speaking with us. Kia ora.

10 **COMMISSIONER STEENSON:** I just have one question.  
11 Thank you for being here. You were saying that you  
12 found ACC difficult to deal with, do you remember just  
13 how long that process took, around abouts?

14 A. To get the payment?

15 **COMMISSIONER STEENSON:** Yeah, just through that kind  
16 of—from when you started something in the 80s, was it a  
17 few years or was it months?

18 A. It was Andrew that did it at the same time, arranged  
19 it, but it wasn't easy and they certainly weren't keen  
20 to pay any money. With that, what I would like to say  
21 is when Janie was getting the independence allowance,  
22 the day she died it stopped and I seem to think that if  
23 there was a set amount that was set to pay somebody for  
24 a lifetime for an independence allowance, then surely  
25 the amount left over, the balance, should go to maybe  
26 her legal partner. You know, if they've set aside a  
27 certain amount of money that if Janie had lived she  
28 would still be entitled to, yeah.

29 **COMMISSIONER STEENSON:** Thank you.

30 **CHAIR:** I've just got one question that relates to the  
31 ACC. You are not getting counselling now, is that  
32 right? Has that been stopped?

33 A. I'm getting—my counsellor has been using ACC  
34 counselling but she's finding the reporting too much, I

1 guess, that it takes a lot of time and she's decided  
2 that she's not going to be doing ACC counselling.

3 **CHAIR:** So, it's not a case of ACC saying you're not  
4 entitled?

5 A. No.

6 **CHAIR:** It is a question of your current counsellor not  
7 wanting to do it any further?

8 A. Yes.

9 **CHAIR:** So, it might be possible to get another  
10 counsellor?

11 A. Oh, it would. I am just not sure that I am ready to.

12 **CHAIR:** That you are up to it because that is a  
13 difficult thing, isn't it, to change?

14 A. Yes.

15 **CHAIR:** How long have you been with this counsellor?

16 A. About eight years.

17 **CHAIR:** It's tough. Thank you. I'm just going to  
18 leave you now with Commissioner Alofivae.

19 **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Good morning, Ms M. Thank you  
20 very much for the way in which you've detailed your  
21 experiences this morning. Thank you also on behalf of  
22 the Commission for bringing Janie's story to life in  
23 the room. It was very powerful to understand the  
24 connection between yourselves but also just the ongoing  
25 consequences and the impact that has followed you all  
26 the way through.

27 It takes enormous courage and the very frank and  
28 honest way in which you've shared and presented your  
29 evidence this morning is well received by the  
30 Commission, so we just want to wish you and your  
31 supporters continued courage and strength as you see  
32 this process out, and thank you for caring enough about  
33 our nation for speaking up on behalf of others who  
34 might not otherwise come forward.

35 A. Thank you.

1       **COMMISSIONER ALOFIVAE:** Thank you for that.

2       **CHAIR:** On that note, I think we'll take the  
3 adjournment before the next witness. Thank you.

4

5           **Hearing adjourned from 12.30 p.m. until 1.30 p.m.**

6

7

8

\*\*\*